



Methodological framework for assessing malaria risk associated with climate change in Côte d'Ivoire

Yao Etienne Kouakou,^{1,2} Iba Dieudonné Dely,^{2,3} Madina Doumbia,^{2,3} Aziza Ouattara,^{1,2} Effah Jemima N'da,^{1,2} Koffi Evrard Brou,^{1,2} Yao Anicet Zouzou,^{1,2} Guéladio Cissé,^{2,4} Brama Koné^{2,3}

¹Nangui Abrogoua University, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire; ²Centre Suisse de Recherches Scientifique en Côte d'Ivoire, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire; ³Péléféro Gon Coulibaly University, Korhogo, Côte d'Ivoire; ⁴Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute, University of Basel, Switzerland

Abstract

Malaria is the leading cause of morbidity among children under five years of age and pregnant women in Côte d'Ivoire. We assessed the geographical distribution of its risk in all climatic zones of the country based on the Fifth Assessment Report (AR5)

Correspondence: Yao Etienne Kouakou, Nangui Abrogoua University, 02 BP 801 Abidjan 02, autoroute d'Abobo, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire. Tel.: +2250102951093 E-mail: kyaoetienne@yahoo.fr

Key words: Impact chain, hazard, exposure, vulnerability, climate zone, Côte d'Ivoire.

Conflict of interest: the authors declare no potential conflict of interest, and all authors confirm accuracy.

Availability of data and materials: all data generated or analyzed during this study are included in this published article.

Acknowledgments: we would like to express our sincerest gratitude to the National Climate Change Program (PNCC) of the Ministry of the Environment and Sustainable Development (MINEDD) for placing its trust in us to conduct studies and prepare the report on the health component of the National Adaptation Plan. We would also like to express our gratitude to the Centre Suisse de Recherche Scientifique in Côte d'Ivoire for its invaluable material and technical support. We would also like to express our gratitude to the HE2AT Center for its financial support, which made it possible for us to finalize this article.

Received: 20 March 2024. Accepted: 30 June 2024.

©Copyright: the Author(s), 2024 Licensee PAGEPress, Italy Geospatial Health 2024; 19:1285 doi:10.4081/gh.2024.1285

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0).

Publisher's note: all claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article or claim that may be made by its manufacturer is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

of the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) approach to climate risk analysis. This methodology considers three main driving components affecting the risk: Hazard, exposure and vulnerability. Considering the malaria impact chain, various variables were identified for each of the risk factors and for each variable, a measurable indicator was identified. These indicators were then standardized, weighted through a participatory approach based on expert judgement and finally aggregated to calculate current and future risk. With regard to the four climatic zones in the country: Attieen (sub-equatorial regime) in the South, Baouleen (humid tropical) in the centre, Sudanese or equatorial (tropical transition regime) in the North and the mountainous (humid) in the West. Malaria risk among pregnant women and children under 5 was found to be higher in the mountainous and the Baouleen climate, with the hazard highest in the mountainous climate and Exposure very high in the Attieen climate. The most vulnerable districts were those in Baouleen, Attieen and the mountainous climates. By 2050, the IPCC representative concentration pathway (RCP) 4.5 and 8.5 scenarios predict an increase in risk in almost all climatic zones, compared to current levels, with the former considering a moderate scenario, with an emissions peak around 2040 followed by a decline and RCP 8.5 giving the highest baseline emissions scenario, in which emissions continue to rise. It is expected that the AR5 approach to climate risk analysis will be increasingly used in climate risk assessment studies so that it can be better assessed at a variety of scales.

Introduction

Climate change, including climate variability and its adverse effects on human health, is a global concern (Beaudoin & Gosselin, 2016; Romanello *et al.*, 2021; Watts *et al.*, 2021; Agache *et al.*, 2022; IPCC, 2023). The various climate change scenarios show the importance of the impact of these changes on diseases, particularly those linked to the environment (Cissé *et al.*, 2022). Many authors indicate that global warming and increased climate variability can increase malaria spread specifically in middle-income countries (Endo *et al.*, 2017; Shah *et al.*, 2019; Ogega & Alobo, 2021; Romanello *et al.*, 2021). It's known that the spatiotemporal distribution of vector-borne diseases is likely to expand as a result of more favourable temperatures, which would lead to changes in the dynamics of communicable diseases (Lowe, 2018; Fletcher *et al.*, 2022).

In West Africa, climate change in recent years contributed to increased malaria spread (Yamana *et al.*, 2016; Endo *et al.*, 2017; M'Bra *et al.*, 2018). Indeed, since the 1970s, West Africa has been subject to rising temperatures, falling average rainfall, shifting rainy

seasons and often more heavy rainfall (Kouakou et al., 2007; Kouassi et al., 2010; Engelbrecht et al., 2015; Nangombe et al., 2019), thus contributing to the increased spread of vector-borne diseases. In Côte d'Ivoire, malaria, diarrheal diseases and acute respiratory infections (ARIs) have the highest impacts among children under 5 years of age (under-5) (MSHPCMU, 2021). However, with an impact of 173.43 cases per 1,000 in the general population, malaria is the leading cause of medical consultations in Côte d'Ivoire (MSHPCMU, 2021). Pregnant women and children under-5 are the groups most vulnerable to the disease (MSHPCMU, 2021). Moreover, the geographical distribution of malaria infection in the country is not homogeneous (Raso et al., 2012). Azongnibo et al. (2023) note that the western zone had the highest impact rates, while Adja et al. (2022) observe high rates spreading in the northern, western and eastern regions, both in urban and rural areas, while Assouho et al. (2020) report persistence of high and heterogeneous malaria rates despite the distribution of long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs). Importantly, the spread of malaria is influenced by changes in weather conditions, which affect the life cycle of malaria vectors (Bhatt et al., 2015; Khan, 2017; Segun et al., 2020; Tiu et al., 2021). There are considerable climatic changes along the south to north axis in Côte d'Ivoire, with three (3) different climatic regimes corresponding to different ecological zones (Kouassi et al., 2010). Several authors have shown the influence of climatic conditions on malaria in various regions across the country (Patz & Olson, 2006; M'Bra et al., 2018; Doumbia et al., 2023). However, few projects have focused on the national scale. As pointed out by the German provider of international cooperation 'Deutsche Germam Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit' (GIZ), the Sixth Assessment Report (AR6) of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) is still not used systematically everywhere (GIZ, 2017; GIZ et al., 2018), the main aim of this study was to use the previous one, AR5, to measure the present and future risk of malaria in different agro-ecological zones along the equator.

Materials and Methods

Conceptual approach

The methodology focused on to the risk-centred assessment framework of IPCC (2014), in which risk is expressed as a function of three components: Hazard, Exposure and Vulnerability. Figure 1 shows the malaria impact chain (IC) approach (Schneiderbauer et al., 2020; Zebisch et al., 2021; Menk et al., 2022; Zebisch et al., 2022; Estoque et al., 2022) that describes the stages from vector development to disease spread and risk. ICs are conceptual models used to capture this kind of factors illustrating how they lead to specific risks (Menk et al., 2022). The IC method follows a general assessment framework consistent with the IPCC's AR5 concept on climate risk. Hazard refers to the potential occurrence of climate-related physical events that may cause damage and loss (represented here by rainfall and temperature); while exposure refers to the presence of people (pregnant women and children under-5 in this study) in locations that could be adversely affected, regard to potential harm, loss, or damage; and vulnerability refers to sensitivity or susceptibility and is a function of capacity to cope and adapt to harm (IPCC, 2014; GIZ, 2017; Estoque et al., 2020). Based on this IC, various variables were identified for each of the risk factors and for each variable, a measurable indicator was identified. Table 1 lists all variables and measurable indicators for which data were collected.





Study area

Côte d'Ivoire is a coastal country located in the intertropical zone of West Africa. It is a malaria-endemic zone, with the climate determined by the position of the intertropical convergence zone (ITCZ), depending on the season resulting in four clearly marked climatic regimes (Figure 2). The transitional equatorial regime in the South called the Attiéen climate (zone I), has two dry and two wet seasons. The attenuated, humid tropical, transitional equatorial regime in the Centre called the Baouléen climate (zone II), has also four seasons: two dry seasons and two rainy seasons. The transitional tropical regime Sudanese or equtorial climate in the North (zone III), has two seasons: a long dry season and a short rainy season. Finally, the Mountain climate in the West (zone IV), has a long rainy season and a short dry season (Soro *et al.*, 2016).

Data collection

Data collection included secondary data concerning all the variables listed in Table 2 and they were obtained from available documents (INS, 2022; MICS, 2016; INS, 2015) and the web pages of some Institutions. Data on the malaria impact were obtained from the website of the University of Washington in the USA (https://vizhub.healthdata.org/lbd/) and covered the period from 2000 to 2019, which is the period of the current risk study. Precipitation and temperature data were taken from the World Bank's website (https://climateknowledgeportal.worldbank.org/ download-data) covering the period 1991-2016. These data were downloaded for all weather stations covering the Ivorian territory.



Figure 1. Impact chain of malaria-related morbidity and mortality risk.





As the health data obtained covered the period 2000-2019, the meteorological data were completed from 2016 to 2019 using linear regression based on data from the NASA website covering the period 1991-2020. Future risk was assessed at the 2050 horizon. Table 2 summarizes the measurable indicators for the selected variables. Thus, the *Hazard* and the *Exposure* risk components were assessed using two (02) indicators, while six (06) indicators were used for the *Vulnerability* one, including one (01) for *Sensitivity* and five (05) for *Adaptive Capacity*. These measurable indicators were standardized, weighted and aggregated to calculate current and future risks.

Standardizing the indicators

Standardization consisted of transposing the various indicator values into the same unit and scale of magnitude. This was done using the min-max method (GIZ, 2017). This method transforms all values into scores ranging from 0 (optimal situation) to 1 (critical situation), based on the following equation:

$$X_{i,0 \text{ to } 1} = \frac{X_i - X_{\min}}{X_{\max} - X_{\min}}$$
 (Eq.1)

where X_i represents the individual data point to be transformed; X_{min} the lowest value for this indicator; X_{max} the highest value for this indicator; and X_i , the new value between 0 and 1 we wished to calculate. The indicators were then weighted and aggregated.

Indicator weighting and aggregation

Weighting consists of assigning weights to the indicators. The participative approach was prioritized, and the experts' opinions



Figure 2. Districts and climatic zones of Côte d'Ivoire.

Risk component		Variable	Indicator	Method	Scale	Data source
Hazard	Climate	Rainfall Temperature	Average rainfall (mm) Average temperature (°C)	Min-max method Min-max method	Synoptic stations Synoptic stations	World Bank, year? GIZ, 2017 World Bank, year? GIZ, 2017
Vulnerability	Sensitivity	Possible low immunity in children and pregnant women	Population grouped by age and gender (%)	Min-max method	District	RASS, 2020, GIZ, 2017
	Adaptive capacity	Low availability of health services	Access to health care	Min-max method	District	MICS, 2016, GIZ, 2017
		Low household income available for health care	Average annual income of household head (FCFA)	Min-max method	District	MICS, 2016, GIZ, 2017
		Not using preventive chemo-prophylaxis	Proportion of households not using preventive prophylaxis (%)	Min-max method	District	MICS, 2025, 2016, RASS, 2020, ENVI, 2015 , GIZ, 2017
		Inadequate use of vector control (impregnated bed nets and insecticides)	Proportion of households misusing impregnated bed nets (%)	Min-max method	District	MICS, 2016, GIZ, 2017
		Selfmedication	Proportion of households practicing auto-medication (%)	Min-max method	District	MICS, 2016 , GIZ, 2017
Exposure	Exposure	Children under-5	Population grouped by age and gender (%)	Min-max method	District	INS, 2018, 2019-2021, GIZ, 2017
		Pregnant women	Proportion of pregnant women (%)	Min-max method	District	Population data, 2019-2021. , GIZ, 2017

Table 1. Indicators used to calculate the malaria morbidity risk index.

FCFA, Central African CFA franc; RASS, The Annual Health situation Report; Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey; ENVI, Survey of household living standards in Côte d'Ivoire; INS, National Institute of Statistics.

prevailed. The experts assigned weights ranging from 1 to 5 with regard to the various indicators, according to their importance in terms of risk factors. As for the final risk calculation, weights were also assigned to the various risk factors. The composite indicator (CI) was then calculated for each risk factor according to equation 2 below:

$$CI = \frac{I_1 * w_1 + I_2 * w_2 + I_3 * w_3 \dots I_n * w_n}{\Sigma_1^n w}$$
(Eq.2)

where I an individual indicator of a risk factor; and W the weight assigned to the indicator.

Final risk calculation

The current final risk was then evaluated according to the following formula:

$$Risk = \frac{(Hazard*W_H)+(Vulnerability*W_V)+(Exposure*W_E)}{W_H+W_V+W_E}$$
(Eq.3)

where W is the weighting of the risk factors assigned by the experts.

Future risk was assessed in the same way as current risk, but with climate parameters and population data projected to 2050. Other parameters, which could not be projected due to lack of data, were supposed to remain constant until 2050. Temperature and precipitation were projected by compiling data from a set of 14 climate models. The multi-model average (of this set) provided projected data closer to observed data. These models contain RCPs 4.5

Precipitation

Temperature

Sensitivity

Pregnant women

Children under-5

Adaptive capacity

Table 2. List of variables and indicatorsmeasured by risk component. Component Variable Indicator

(impregnated bed nets and insecticides)

Not using preventive chemoprophylaxis

Low availability of health services

Self-medication

Low household income

Table 3. Risk classification.

Hazard

Exposure

Vulnerability

Risk value (0 to 1)	Description
00 - 0,2	Very low
0,2-0,4	Low
$ \begin{array}{c} 0,2-0,4\\ 0,4-0,6\\ 0,6-0,8\end{array} $	Intermediate
0,6 - 0,8	High
0,8 - 01	Very high



Results

Weights assigned to the indicators

Table 4 shows the weights assigned to the indicators according to risk factor. For the hazard component, considering that mosquitoes develop more during the rainy season, the experts assigned a relatively higher weight to rainfall than to temperature. Regarding exposure, the experts considered that children under-5 were more exposed (weight of 2 out of 5) than pregnant women (1 out of 5). Considering the importance of the immune system in plasmodium spread, the experts assigned a weight of 4/5 to the sensitivity indicator of the Vulnerability component. In terms of adaptive capacity, the experts considered that inadequate use of insecticide-treated mosquito nets and intra-domestic insecticides, as well as the failure to use preventive chemoprophylaxis, would reduce adaptive capacity considerably. These two variables therefore play an important role for the adaptive capacity, hence the weight of 3 out of 5 was attributed to each of them. Self-medication and level of income for health care came just after the first two indicators, with a weighting of 2 out of 5, since the experts attached a greater importance to them than to accessibility to health services (1 out of 5).



Household income allocated to health (%)

Proportion of households not using preventive prophylaxis (%)

OPEN ACCESS

Self-medication (%)

Access to healthcare (%)







Malaria risk for pregnant women and children under-5

The analysis of Figure 3 shows that *hazard* due to the climate is high (between 0.6 and 0.8) in climate zone IV, intermediate in climate zones I and II in Goh Djiboua (Gagnoa) and Sassandra Marahoué (Daloa) Districts, and low (between 0.2 and 0.4) in climate zone III. In terms of exposure, pregnant women and children under-5 in Abidjan District in climate zone I were shown to have a very high level of exposure compared to those in the country's other districts. Pregnant women and children under-5 in climate zones II and III had a low level of *Exposure* (between 0.2 and 0.4) in districs, such as Zanzan (Bondoukou), Sassandra Marahoué (Daloa), Woroba (Séguéla) and Denguélé (Odienné). In terms of vulnerability, districts in all four climate zones had an intermediate level (between 0.4 and 0.6), except for Yamoussoukro and Zanzan in climate zone II and Denguélé in climate zone III, which had a low level (between 0.2 and 0.4). Of the three risk factors, the experts gave greater weight to vulnerability and exposure. The analysis of Figure 4, with Table 5 showing the weights assigned to the various risk factors, reveals that malaria risk among pregnant women and children under-5 was intermediate in the mountainous area, such as Abidjan and Sassandra Marahoué Districts. However, the Mountains District, with a score of 0.54, had the highest level of risk at the national level. All other districts showed a low risk.

The spatial distribution of malaria morbidity risk levels among pregnant women and children under-5 (Figure 5) showed that the three districts with intermediate risk levels are located in climate zones I, II and IV, with those in climate zone III being at low risk. Two of the three intermediate-risk districts were found to be located in the western part of the country.

Precipitation, temperature and population projections to 2050

Rainfall projections for 2050 under both scenarios (rcp 4.5 or rcp8.5) show an overall increase of over 200 mm in all climate zones. The highest rainfall amounts are still expected in the western part of the country, and the lowest in the North. It is estimated that temperatures will increase by approximately 1°C on average by 2050. Both scenarios predict rising temperatures in every district. The highest average temperatures will be seen in the Bas-Sassandra District (over 28°C). In the Lagunes, Abidjan, Lacs, Goh-djiboua and Comoe Districts, average temperatures should be

Table 4. Weights assigned by experts to risk component indicators.

Component	Indicator		Weight allocated
Hazard	Annua lrainfall (mm) Average annual temperature (°	C)	2 1
Exposure	Pregnant women (%)		1
	Children under-5 (%)		2
Vulnerability	Sensitivity	Children under-5 and pregnant women (%)	4
	Adaptive capacity	Use of vector control (impregnated bed nets and insecticides) (%)	3
		Households using self-medication (%)	2
		Household income allocated to health (%)	2
		Households not using preventive prophylaxis (%)	3
		Access to healthcare (%)	1





Figure 4. Level of malaria morbidity risk among pregnant women and children under.

Vallée du Bandama

(Bouaké)

Lacs (Dimbokro)

Zanzan (Bondoukou)

Montagnes (Man)





between 26 and 27°C. Climate zone IV, situated within the Mountains District, is predicted to be the least affected, with temperatures expected to range between 25 and 26°C. The population projection to 2050 also shows population growth, with Abidjan in comparison to other districts continue to be very densely populated, followed by Savanes, Bas-Sassandra, Vallée du Bandama and Goh-Djiboua Districts.

Future malaria risk for pregnant women and children under-5

Analysis of Figure 6A and 6B shows a relatively similar evolution of hazard, exposure and vulnerability in the different districts by 2050, according to the two scenarios. Climate hazard is expected to be very high in climate zone IV in the Mountains District (Man), with a score of 1, and intermediate in climate zones II and III in the Sassandra Marahoué and Woroba Districts, respectively. The Bas-Sassandra, Zanzan and Savanes Districts, located in climate zones I, II and III, respectively, will have low hazard levels under both scenarios. In terms of exposure, the scenarios describe a situation almost identical to the current level of exposure. Pregnant women and children under five in the Abidjan District should remain highly exposed, with vulnerability remaining intermediate in all climatic zones. However, the districts of Sassandra Marahoué, Vallée du Bandama (in climate zone II), Bas-Sassandra and Comoé (in climate zone I) stand out, with significantly higher scores. Figure

7A and 7B show a similar evolution of the malaria up to 2050 under the two scenarios. The level of risk should be intermediate in climate zones I, II and IV in Abidjan, Sassandra Marahoué and the Mountains District, while climate zone III should have a low-risk level. Overall, the RCP 4.5 scenario may present a higher level of risk than RCP 8.5 by 2050 as presented in Figure 8. Only in Abidjan District in climate zone I should the risk level of RCP 8.5 be greater than that offered by RCP 4.5. The Mountains District, in climate zone IV, would have the highest malaria risk, while Zanzan and Denguélé Districts, in climate zones II and III respectively having the lowest.

Comparison of current and future malaria risk levels in pregnant women and children under-5

It is worth noting that the risk of future malaria morbidity in pregnant women and children under-5 may be greater than the current risk (Figure 9) under both scenarios. However, the RCP 4.5 scenario presents a slightly higher level of risk than the RCP 8.5 one.

Discussion

Impact chain and indicator weighting

The IC method (Estoque *et al.*, 2022) is consistent with the AR5 concept and a straightforward, practical and useful approach for gaining insight into climate-related impacts. As Zebisch *et al.*





Figure 5. Spatial distribution of current malaria morbidity risk among pregnant women 4.5 sce children

Figure 6. *Hazard, exposure* and *vulnerability* of pregnant women and children under five due to malaria by 2050. **A)** Under the RCP 4.5 scenario; **B)** and the RCP 8.5 scenario in Côte d'IvoireAnd children under five by administrative district.









Figure 7. Spatial distribution of future malaria risk in pregnant women and children under five by 2050. **A**) Under the RCP 4.5 scenario; **B**) and the RCP 8.5 scenario in Côte d'Ivoire.





Figure 8. Future malaria risk in pregnant women and children under 5 by 2050 under the RCP 4.5 and RCP 8.5 scenarios in Côte d'Ivoire.

Figure 9. Comparative assessment of current and future malaria risk in pregnant women and children under 5 years.

(2021) suggest, it serves the selection of appropriate indicators and guids a qualitative assessment based on expert opinion. This proved to be a valuable tool for weighting the indicators and determining the risk score as assessed by AR5. It is widely recognized that temperature and rainfall are the main environmental determinants of malaria. In this risk assessment, these variables represented the climatic hazard well. The indicators measured for these variables were the mean annual rainfall and the mean annual temperature. While both of these indicators are undoubtedly important in the impact chain (Tiu et al., 2021; Yamba et al., 2023), the experts felt that the former deserved a slightly higher weighting than the latter and should therefore be accepted as of slightly higher importance. Indeed, based on their experience and the literature, the experts believed that rain may play a role in the vector development process as it affects the development of larvae, particularly when rainfall is limited and the runoff not excessive. The rains may also increase the number of stagnant water points that are favourable for larval development. It is also worth noting that temperature can influence the intensity of spread through its effects on the growth of the mosquito vector population and the development of the pathogen in the vector (Johnson et al., 2023). Moreover, several studies have indicated an increase in malaria-related morbidity during the rainy season in Côte d'Ivoire (Bassa et al., 2016; Henry et al., 2003; M'Bra et al., 2018). For example, the work of M'Bra and colleagues (2018) indicate that a progressive increase of 10 mm in monthly rainfall in the Korhogo Region in northern Côte d'Ivoire is, on average, associated with a 1.2% increase in the number of clinical cases of malaria episodes one to two months later. It would appear that a 1°C increase in the mean monthly temperature is associated with a 3.5% decrease in malaria episodes, which makes it important to consider the weight of the mean annual rainfall in relation to the mean annual temperature. Our analysis of the hazard component of risk indicates that the current climatic hazard is relatively high in climate zone IV in the Mountains District (Man), intermediate in climatic zones II and I in Sassandra Marahoué (Daloa) and Goh Djiboua (Gagnoa) Districts and relatively low in climatic zone III. This change in climate appears to align with the spatial distribution of rainfall in the country. It would thus appear that the strength of the annual rainfall heights in Côte d'Ivoire is generally higher in the West of the country, the Mountains District, and progressively lower towards the Northeast in climate zone II in the Zanzan District as described by Soro et al. already in 2016.

Exposure of pregnant women and children under-5

The level of exposure to climatic hazards is highest in climate zone I in the Abidjan District. This high exposure could be explained by the high concentration of under-5children and pregnant women in this district. Indeed, the indicators considered for the *exposure* component are the percentage of these two groups. As Abidjan District, with a population of over 4.0 million, is home to a fifth (20.8%) of the country's total population (INS, 2021), it is thus obvious that there are more pregnant women and children in this District than in others. However, various authors have noted a significant increase in human exposure to vectors due to the growth in human and vector populations, globalization, population mobility and urbanization (UNEP, 2018; Rocklöv & Dubrow, 2020; Semenza, 2021), which could explain the importance of exposure in this district, which is also a highly urbanized. When calculating expected changes up to 2050, our results show no clear





change with respect to *exposure*. These findings are in line with those of Winsemius *et al.* (2018), who found that exposure does not change significantly under future climate scenarios by analyzing household survey and hydrological data on river floods and droughts from 52 countries. However, the absolute number of people potentially exposed may increase or decrease significantly depending on the scenario and region (Winsemius *et al.*, 2018). It appears therefore important to make targeted investments (e.g., in early warning systems) to improve protection against such exposures in order to increase the resilience of vulnerable populations as proposed by Cissé and colleagues (2022).

Vulnerability of pregnant women and children under-5

As for vulnerability, the experts gave more weight to the sensitivity indicator than to adaptive capacity, which would mean that vulnerability here is more related to the sensitivity of pregnant women and children under-5. Indeed, according to several authors, pregnancy and maternal status increase vulnerability to heat, infectious diseases, food-borne infections and air pollution in pregnant women (Arroyo et al., 2016; Ngo & Horton, 2016; Zhang et al., 2017). However, children are particularly vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. Indeed, they often show unique pathways of exposure and sensitivity to climate risks, given their immature physiology and metabolism and their high consumption of air, food and water relative to body weight compared to adults (Kim, 2016). To this end, particular emphasis is placed on the sensitivity indicator compared to the adaptive capacity one in this study. Thus, districts in climate zone II (Sassandra Marahoué, Vallée du Bandama), zone I (Comoé) and zone IV (Mountains) had an intermediate level of vulnerability, while the other districts had a low level of vulnerability, particularly in climatic zone III. This change in vulnerability between districts and climatic zones could be linked to adaptive capacity in the different districts and, in particular, to indicators such as inadequate use of insecticide-treated mosquito nets and insecticides in the home and non-use of preventive chemoprophylaxis by pregnant women and children. Indeed, the experts considered that these two indicators further weaken the adaptive capacity of pregnant women and under-5 children, hence the importance of the weights of these two indicators. Indeed, Houngbedji et al. (2015) observed that the actual number of children regularly using mosquito nets is quite low in Côte d'Ivoire. These authors also noted a reduction in malaria prevalence from 43% to 33% between 2010 and 2014 in Côte d'Ivoire following the strengthening of the national malaria control policy, which resulted in the distribution of almost 30,000,000 insecticide-treated bed nets over the same period.

Malaria risk

In general, the current malaria risk is considered to be intermediate in climate zones I, II and IV. However, it is worth noting that Mountains District, situated in climate zone IV, had the highest level of risk at the national level. This could be linked to the magnitude of the *hazard* component, the low adaptive capacity, and also to the geographical location of this district. Of the 14 districts, this district has the most rugged terrain and the highest altitudes compared with the rest of the country. However, according to Midekisa *et al.* (2015) and Siraj *et al.* (2014) malaria has been observed to move to higher altitudes in the mountainous regions of Colombia and Ethiopia in warmer years. This indicates that, without intervention, malaria may potentially increase at higher alti-





tudes as the climate warms. It is possible that the relatively minor change in risk factors by 2050 may be due to the fact that only the hazard and exposure components have been projected to rise, while other variables remain constant. A comparison between current and future risk levels suggests that the RCP 8.5 scenarios present a risk level very similar to the current. However, it is worth noting that the RCP 4.5 scenario presents a higher level of current risk than RCP 8.5. It is also worth noting that the RCP 8.5 scenario, which is arguably more pessimistic than the RCP 4.5 scenario, may not be as significant in this context. It may be due to the fact that the RCP 8.5 scenario predicts a greater temperature rise than RCP 4.5 does. It is possible that this increase could come at the expense of precipitation, i.e. a reduction in rainfall could potentially impact larval breeding sites. In addition, the relationship between malaria and temperature is not straightforward and projections of changes in risk under climate change can result in complex patterns (Ebi et al., 2018). Some studies have indicated that an increase in monthly rainfall may lead to an increase in clinical malaria episodes (Han et al., 2017; M'Bra et al., 2018; Panda et al., 2019). However, other studies have observed a pattern of reduced burden with increasing temperatures in West Africa (Yamana et al., 2016; M'Bra et al., 2018). Finally, some authors have even suggested that a warming climate does not necessarily lead to an increase in malaria spread in Africa (Murdock et al., 2016; Tompkins & Caporaso, 2016).

Study limitations

The use of expert opinion was an important element in the methodological approach adopted. However, as observed by Hendrikx et al. (2001), the results obtained using this approach may vary from one group of experts to another. However, we made considerable efforts to address this limitation by basing our choices on literature-based justifications. Another limitation of this study is the lack of daily information, which could have provided more accurate data. It is worth noting that for diseases whose onset extends over fairly short periods, it can be challenging to fully appreciate the effect of climatic changes with annual data. It would be beneficial if countries could allocate resources to establish a health information and monitoring system acquiring daily data as that would allow for a more nuanced understanding of the nuances of change. Importantly, IPCC may have issued further clarification about the Risk concept in the AR6 after completion of this study that could better reflect its various uses and contexts, thereby clarifving issues leading to differing interpretations and applications across their Working Groups and in different reports.

Conclusions

This study has shown that the current and future malaria risk due to climate is greater in the Mountain District (Man) of Côte d'Ivoire. However, the city of Abidjan remains the most exposed to malaria risk. The level of vulnerability varies from district to district, depending on adaptive capacity and population practices. The IPCC AR5 framework is useful for understanding climaterelated impacts, *exposure*, *vulnerability* and *risk* as this approach combines different indicators that are assessed on the same scale based on standardization. It can also integrate both quantitative and qualitative approaches to risk assessment that needs to be used more widely in a variety of studies and at different scales. In order to control the current and future risk of malaria in Côte d'Ivoire, it would be advisable to strengthen vector control measures in the various districts, particularly in the mountainous districts. Preventive measures such as early warning systems are also needed to strengthen the resilience of vulnerable populations.

References

- Adja AM, Assouho KF, Assi SB, Guindo-Coulibaly N, Tia E, Sagna AB, Zoh DD, Moro AC, Yapi A, 2022. High vectorial transmission of malaria in urban and rural settings in the northern, western and easternregions of Côte d'Ivoire. J Vector Borne Dis 59:275.
- Agache I, Sampath V, Aguilera J, Akdis CA, Akdis M, Barry M, Bouagnon A, Chinthrajah S, Collins W, Dulitzki C, Erny B, Gomez J, Goshua A, Jutel M, Kizer KW, Kline O, LaBeaud AD, Pali-Schöll I, Perrett KP, Peters RL, Plaza MP, Prunicki M, Sack T, Salas RN, Sindher SB, Sokolow SH, Thiel C, Veidis E, Wray BD, Traidl-Hoffmann C, Witt C, Nadeau KC, 2022. Climate change and global health: A call to more research and more action. Allergy 77 :1389–407.
- Arroyo V, Díaz J, Ortiz C, Carmona R, Sáez M, Linares C, 2016. Short termeffect of air pollution, noise and heat waves on preterm births in Madrid (Spain). Environ Res 145:162–8.
- Assouho KF, Adja AM, Guindo-Coulibaly N, Tia E, Kouadio AMN, Zoh DD, Koné M, Kessé N, Koffi B, Sagna AB, Poinsignon A, Yapi A, 2020. Vectorial transmission of malaria in major districts of Côte d'Ivoire. J Medical Entomol 57;908–14.
- Azongnibo KR, Guindo-Coulibaly N, Bonnet E, Kokro-Djahouri MN, Assouho KF, Niamke MG, Fournet F, Anoh PK, Assi S-B, Adja AM, 2023. Spatiotemporal analysis of malaria incidence in Côte d'Ivoire from 2015 to 2019. Transactions of The Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene 117:301–9.
- Bassa FK, Ouattara M, Silué KD, Adiossan LG, Baikoro N, Koné S, N'Cho M, Traoré M, Bonfoh B, Utzinger J, N'Goran EK, 2016. Epidemiology of malaria in the taabo health and demographic surveillance system, south-central Côte d'Ivoire. Malaria J 15:9.
- Beaudoin M, Gosselin P, 2016. An effective public health program to reduce urban heat islands in Québec, Canada. Rev Panam Salud Publica 40:160–6.
- Bhatt S, Weiss DJ, Cameron E, Bisanzio D, Mappin B, Dalrymple U, Battle K, Moyes CL, Henry A, Eckhoff PA, Wenger EA, Briët O, Penny MA, Smith TA, Bennett A, Yukich J, Eisele TP, Griffin JT, Fergus CA, Lynch M, Lindgren F, Cohen JM, Murray CLJ, Smith DL, Hay SI, Cibulskis RE, Gething PW, 2015. The effect of malaria control on Plasmodium falciparum in Africa between 2000 and 2015. Nature 2015;526:207-11.
- Cissé G, McLeman R, 2022. Health, Wellbeing and the Changing Structure of Communities, in: Climate Change 2022: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability. Contribution of Working Group II to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA, pp. 1041–170.
- Doumbia M, Coulibaly J, Silué D, Cissé G, N'dione J, Koné B, 2023. Effects of ClimateVariability on Malaria Transmission in Southern Côte d'Ivoire, West Africa. Int J Environ Res Public Health 20:7102.
- Ebi KL, Tomoko H, Katie H, Andrew M, Shlomit P, Berry P, 2018. Health risks of warming of 1.5 °C, 2 °C, and higher, above preindustrial temperatures. Environ Res Letters 13:063007.





- Endo N, Yamana T, Eltahir EA, 2017. Impact of climate change on malaria in Africa: acombined modelling and observational study. Lancet 389 :S7.
- Engelbrecht F, Adegoke J, Bopape M-J, Naidoo M, Garland R, Thatcher M, McGregor J, Katzfey J, Werner M, Ichoku C, Gatebe C, 2015. Projections of rapidly rising surface temperatures over Africa under low mitigation. Environ Res Lett 10;085004.
- Estoque RC, Ooba M, Seposo XT, Togawa T, Hijioka Y, Takahashi K, Nakamura S, 2020. Heat health risk assessment in Philippine cities using remotely sensed data and social-ecological indicators. Nature Comm 11:1581.
- Estoque RC, Ooba M, Togawa T, Yoshioka A, Gomi K, Nakamura S, Tsuji T, Hijiioka Y, Watanabe M, Kitahashi M, 2022. Climate impact chains for envisaging climate risks, vulnerabilities, and adaptation issue Regional Environmental Change 22:133.
- Fletcher IK, Grillet ME, Moreno JE, Drakeley C, Hernández-Villena J, Jones KE, Lowe R, 2022. Synergies between environmental degradation and climate variation on malaria reemergence in southern Venezuela: a spatiotemporal modelling study. Lancet Planet Health 6:e739-48.
- GIZ, 2017. Guide complémentaire sur la vulnérabilité : le concept de risque. Lignes directrices sur l'utilisation de l'approche du Guide de référence sur la vulnérabilité en intégrant le nouveau concept de risque climatique de l'AR5 du GIEC. Bonn : GIZ.
- GIZ, EURAC, UNU-EHS, 2018. Climate Risk Assessment for Eco-system Based Adaptation - A Guidebook for Planners & Practitioners. Accessed 4.28.24. Available from : https://www.bcsla.org/sites/default/files/resources/files/climate-change/downloads/Climate%20Risk%20Assessment %20for%20Eco-system%20Based%20Adaptation%20-%20A%20Guidebook%20for%20Planners%20%26%20Practi tioners.%20%202018.pdf
- Han L, Hudgens MG, Emch ME, Juliano JJ, Keeler C, Martinson F, Kamthunzi P, Tegha G, Lievens M, Hoffman IF, 2017.
 RTS,S/AS01 Malaria Vaccine Efficacy is Not Modified by Seasonal Precipitation: Results from a Phase 3 Randomized Controlled Trial in Malawi. Sci Rep 7:7200.
- Hendrikx P, Barbara D, Tulasne JJ, 2001. Analyse qualitative du risque d'épizootie de peste bovine en république Centrafricaine à partir du Tchad et du Soudan. Epidémiol Santé Anim 40:83-94
- Henry MC, Rogier C, Nzeyimana I, Assi SB, Dossou-Yovo J, Audibert M, Mathonnat J, Keundjian A, Akodo E, Teuscher T, Carnevale P, 2003. Inland valley rice production systems and malaria infection and disease in the savannah of Cote d'Ivoire. Trop Med Internat Health 8:449-58.
- Houngbedji CA, N'Dri PB, Hürlimann E, Yapi RB, Silué KD, Soro G, Koudou BG, Acka CA, Assi SB, Vounatsou P, N'Goran EK, Fantodji A, Utzinger J, Raso G, 2015. Disparities of Plasmodium falciparum infection, malaria-related morbidity and access to malaria prevention and treatment among schoolaged children: a national cross-sectional survey in Côte d'Ivoire. Malar J 14:7.
- INS, 2015. Enquête sur le Niveau de Vie des Ménages en Côte d'Ivoire (ENVI2015) (Enquête). Côte d'Ivoire.
- INS, 2022. Enquête Harmonisée sur le Conditions de Vie des Ménages 2018-2019. https://doi.org/10.48529/8WH3-BF40
- IPCC, 2014. Summary for Policymakers. In: Field CB, Barros VR, Dokken DJ, Mach KJ, Mastrandrea MD, Bilir TE, Chatterjee

M, Ebi KL, Estrada YO, Genova RC, Girma B, Kissel ES, Levy AN, MacCracken S, Mastrandrea PR, White LL (eds) Climate change 2014: impacts, adaptation, and vulnerability. Part A: Global and sectoral aspects. Contribution of Working Group II to the FifthAssessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge UniversityPress, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA pp 1-32.

- IPCC, 2023. IPCC, 2023.Climate Change 2023:Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II and III to the SixthAssessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [CoreWriting Team, H. Lee and J. Romero (eds.)]. IPCC, Geneva, Switzerland. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC). https://doi.org/10.59327/ IPCC/AR6-9789291691647
- Johnson MK, Honey S, Embalil MA, Lakshmi DM, 2023. A review on the influence of environmental temperature in the development, survival, population dynamics and spatial distribution of Aedes Albopictus (Skuse 1894) (Diptera: Culicidae) mosquito. J Communicable 55:58-63.
- Khan S, 2017. The effect of climatic conditions on malaria epidemics in Swat Valle. bioRxiv; 2017. https://doi.org/ 10.1101/122754
- Kim EJ, 2016. U.S. Global Change Research Program: the impacts of climate change on human health in the united states: a scientific assessment. J Am Plann Assoc 82:418–9.
- Kouakou KE, Goula BT, Savane I, 2007. Impacts de la variabilité climatique sur les ressources en eau de surface en zone tropicale humide: cas du bassin versant transfrontalier de La Comoé (Côte d'ivoire Burkina Faso). Eur J Sci Res 16:31–43.
- Kouassi AM, Kouamé KF, Koffi YB, Dje KB, Paturel JE, Oulare S, 2010. Analyse de la variabilité climatique et de ses influences sur les régimes pluviométriques saisonniers en Afrique de l'Ouest : cas du bassin versant du N'zi (Bandama) en Côte d'Ivoire. Cybergeo: Eur J Geogr https://doi.org/10.4000/cybergeo.23388
- M'Bra RK, Kone B, Soro DP, N'krumah RTAS, Soro N, Ndione JA, Sy I, Ceccato P, Ebi KL, Utzinger J, Schindler C, Cissé G, 2018. Impact of climate variability on the transmission risk of malaria in northern Côte d'Ivoire. PLoS ONE 13:e0182304.
- Menk L, Terzi S, Zebisch M, Rome E, Lückerath D, Milde K, Kienberg S, 2022. Climate Change Impact Chains: A Review of Applications, Challenges, and Opportunities for Climate Risk and Vulnerability Assessments. Wea. Climate Soc 14:619–36.
- MICS, 2016. La situation des femmes et des enfants en Côte d'Ivoire.
- Midekisa A, Belay B, Abere M, Estifanos B, Michael CW, 2015. Seasonal associations of climatic drivers and malaria in the highlands of Ethiopia. Parasites & Vectors 8:339.
- MSHPCMU, 2021. Rapport Annuel sur la situation Sanitaire (RASS) 2020. Ministère de la santé et l'Hygiène Publique, rapport annuel sur la situation sanitaire (RASS) 2020 593.
- Murdock CC, Sternberg ED, Thomas MB, 2016. Malaria transmission potential could be reduced with current and future climate change. Scientific Reports 6:27771.
- Nangombe SS, Zhou T, Zhang W, Zou L, Li D, 2019. High-Temperature Extreme Events Over Africa Under 1.5 and 2 °C of Global Warming. J Geophysical Res Atmospheres 124:4413–28.
- Ngo NS, Horton RM, 2016. Climate change and fetal health: The



impacts of exposure to extreme temperatures in New York City. Environ Res 144:158–64.

- Ogega OM, Alobo M, 2021. Impact of 1.5 oC and 2 oC global warming scenarios on malaria transmission in East Africa. AAS Open Res 3:22.
- Panda BB, Mohanty I, Rath A, Pradhan N, Hazra Rk, 2019. Perennial malaria transmission and its association with rainfall at Kalahandi district of Odisha, Eastern India: A retrospective analysis. Trop Biomed 36:610-9.
- Patz JA, Olson SH, 2006. Malaria risk and temperature: Influences from global climate change and local land use practices. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 103:5635–6.
- Raso G, Schur N, Utzinger J, Koudou BG, Tchicaya ES, Rohner F, N'goran EK, Silué KD, Matthys B, Assi S, Tanner M, Vounatsou P, 2012. Mapping malaria risk among children in Côte d'Ivoire using Bayesian geo-statistical models. Malaria J 11:160.
- Rocklöv J, Dubrow R, 2020. Climate change: an enduring challenge for vector-borne disease prevention and control. Nat Immunol 21:479–83.
- Romanello M, McGushin A, Di Napoli C, Drummond P, Hughes N, Jamart L, Kennard H, Lampard P, Solano Rodriguez B, Arnell N, Aveb-Karlsson S, Belesova K, Cai W, Campbell-Lendrum D, Capstick S, Chambers J, Chu L, Ciampi L, Dalin C, Dasandi N, Dasgupta S, Davies M, Dominguez-Salas P, Dubrow R, Ebi KL, Eckelman M, Ekins P, Escobar LE, Georgeson L, Grace D, Graham H, Gunther SH, Hartinger S, He K, Heaviside C, Hess J, Hsu SC, Jankin S, Jimenez MP, Kelman I, Kiesewetter G, Kinney PL, Kjellstrom T, Kniveton D, Lee JKW, Lemke B, Liu Y, Liu Z, Lott M, Lowe R, Martinez-Urtaza J, Maslin M, McAllister L, McMichael C, Mi Z, Milner J, Minor K, Mohajeri N, Moradi-Lakeh M, Morrissey K, Munzert S, Murray KA, Neville T, Nilsson M, Obradovich N, Sewe MO, Oreszczyn T, Otto M, Owfi F, Pearman O, Pencheon D, Rabbaniha M, Robinson E, Rocklöv J, Salas RN, Semenza JC, Sherman J, Shi L, Springmann M, Tabatabaei M, Taylor J, Trinanes J, Shumake-Guillemot J, Vu B, Wagner F, Wilkinson P, Winning M, Yglesias M, Zhang S, Gong P, Montgomery H, Costello A, Hamilton I. 2021. The 2021 report of the Lancet Count down on health and climate change: code red for a healthy future. The Lancet 398(10311), 1619-1662.
- Schneiderbauer S, Baunach D, Pedoth L, Renner K, Fritzsche K, Bollin C, Pregnolato M, Zebisch M, Liersch S, Rivas López MdR, Ruzima S, 2020. Spatial-Explicit Climate Change Vulnerability Assessments Based on Impact Chains. Findings from a Case Study in Burundi. Sustainability 12:6354.
- Segun OE, Shohaimi S, Nallapan M, Lamidi-Sarumoh AA, Salari N, 2020. Statistical Modelling of the Effects of Weather Factors on Malaria Occurrence in Abuja, Nigeria. Int J Environ Res Public Health 17:3474.
- Semenza JC, 2021. Lateral public health: Advancing systemicresilience to climate change. The Lancet Regional Health-Europe 9:100231.
- Shah MM, Krystosik AR, Ndenga BA, Mutuku FM, Caldwell JM, Otuka V, Chebii PK, Maina PW, Jembe Z, Ronga C, Bisanzio D, Anyamba A, Damoah R, Ripp K, Jagannathan P, Mordecai EA, LaBeaud AD, 2019. Malaria smear positivity among Kenyan children peaks at intermedia tetemperatures as predicted by ecological models. Parasites Vectors 12:288.

Siraj AS, Santos-Vega M, Bouma MJ, Yadeta D, Ruiz Carrascal D,

Pascual M, 2014. Altitudinal changes in malaria incidence in highlands of Ethiopia and Colombia. Science 343:1154-58.

- Soro GE, Dao A, Fadika V, Goula Bi TA, Srohorou B, 2016. Estimation des pluies journalières extrêmes supérieures à un seuil en climat tropical: cas de la Côte d'Ivoire. Physio-geo 10:211–27.
- Tiu LA, Wahid WE, Andriani WY, Mirnawati TR, 2021. Impact of temperature and rainfall on incident malaria. IOP Conf. Ser.: Earth Environ. Sci. 755:012084.
- Tompkins AM, Luca C. 2016. Assessment of malaria transmission changes in Africa, due to the climate impact of land use change using coupled model intercomparison project phase 5 earth system models. Geospatial Health 11 :380.
- UNEP, 2018. The Adaptation Gap Report 2018. United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP).
- Watts N, Amann M, Arnell N, Ayeb-Karlsson S, Beagley J, Belesova K, Boykoff M, Byass P, Cai W, Campbell-Lendrum D, Capstick S, Chambers J, Coleman S, Dalin C, Daly M, Dasandi N, Dasgupta S, Davies M, Di Napoli C, Dominguez-Salas P, Drummond P, Dubrow R, Ebi KL, Eckelman M, Ekins P, Escobar LE, Georgeson L, Golder S, Grace D, Graham H, Haggar P, Hamilton I, Hartinger S, Hess J, Hsu SC, Hughes N, Jankin Mikhavlov S. Jimenez MP. Kelman I. Kennard H. Kiesewetter G, Kinney PL, Kjellstrom T, Kniveton D, Lampard P, Lemke B, Liu Y, Liu Z, Lott M, Lowe R, Martinez-Urtaza J, Maslin M, McAllister L, McGushin A, McMichael C, Milner J, Moradi-Lakeh M, Morrissey K, Munzert S, Murray KA, Neville T, Nilsson M, Sewe MO, Oreszczyn T, Otto M, Owfi F, Pearman O, Pencheon D, Quinn R, Rabbaniha M, Robinson E, Rocklöv J, Romanello M, Semenza JC, Sherman J, Shi L, Springmann M, Tabatabaei M, Taylor J, Triñanes J, Shumake-Guillemot J, Vu B, Wilkinson P, Winning M, Gong P, Montgomery H, Costello A, 2021. The 2020 report of The Lancet Countdown on health and climate change: responding to converging crises. Lancet 397 :129-70.
- Winsemius HC, Jongman B, Veldkamp TI, Hallegatte S, Bangalore M, Ward PJ, 2018. Disasterrisk, climate change, and poverty: assessing the global exposure of poor people to floods and droughts. Environ Develop Econ 23:328–48.
- Yamana TK, Bomblies A, Eltahir EA, 2016. Climate change unlikely to increase malaria burden in West Africa. Nature Clim Change 6:1009–13.
- Yamba EI, Fink AH, Badu K, Asare EO, Tompkins AM, Amekudzi LK, 2023. Climate drivers of malaria transmission seasonality and their relative importance in sub-saharan Africa. GeoHealth 7:e2022GH000698.
- Zebisch M, Schneiderbauer S, Fritzsche K, Bubeck P, Kienberger S, Kahlenborn W, Schwan S, Bellow T, 2021. The vulnerability sourcebook and climate impact chains a standardised framework for a climate vulnerability and risk assessment. Internat J Climate Change Strategies Manag 13:35–59.
- Zebisch M, Terzi S, Pittore M, Renner K, Schneiderbauer S, 2022. Climate Impact Chains—A Conceptual Modelling Approach for Climate Risk Assessment in the Context of Adaptation Planning, in: Kondrup, C., Mercogliano, P., Bosello, F., Mysiak, J., Scoccimarro, E., Rizzo, A., Ebrey, R., Ruiter, M. de, Jeuken, A., Watkiss, P. (Eds.), Climate Adaptation Modelling. Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp. 217–224.
- Zhang Y, Yu C, Wang L, 2017. Temperature exposure during pregnancy and birth outcomes: An updated systematic review of epidemiological evidence. Environ Pollut 225:700–12.